

Weighted Score Sheet
RFP ETD0011

Consulting Actuary to the State of Wisconsin Employee Trust Funds Board for the Wisconsin Retirement System and Related Programs

	Raw Score	Weight	Weighted Score	GRS Gabriel Roeder Smith	PricewaterhouseCoopers	Cheiron Inc	Cavanaugh Macdonald	Milliman	Segal Consulting
2. Mandatory Proposer Qualifications and Terms									
2.1 Experience and References	10	20.0%	2.0	1.90	1.40	1.40	1.45	0.95	1.20
2.2 Standards for Supervising Actuaries	10	20.0%	2.0	1.75	1.65	1.25	1.00	1.15	1.10
2.3 Security and Privacy	10	5.0%	0.5	0.39	0.44	0.38	0.31	0.23	0.31
2.4 Quality Control	10	5.0%	0.5	0.43	0.44	0.44	0.35	0.39	0.39
Total		50.0%	5.0	4.46	3.93	3.46	3.11	2.71	3.00
3. Actuarial Consulting Services									
3.1 General Actuarial and Consulting Services	10	10.0%	1.0	0.75	0.78	0.70	0.58	0.58	0.68
3.2 Annual Actuarial Reports to the ETF Board	10	3.0%	0.3	0.25	0.25	0.22	0.17	0.17	0.12
3.3 Triennial Experience Study	10	2.0%	0.2	0.17	0.17	0.15	0.12	0.13	0.07
3.4 Other Technical Services	10	5.0%	0.5	0.34	0.43	0.28	0.28	0.25	0.16
3.5 User Applications to be Provided	10	4.0%	0.4	0.31	0.25	0.25	0.19	0.33	0.15
3.6 Valuation Report Due Dates	10	2.0%	0.2	0.18	0.14	0.09	0.12	0.11	0.12
3.7 Additional Services	10	4.0%	0.4	0.30	0.28	0.31	0.27	0.27	0.26
Total		30.0%	3.0	2.29	2.29	1.99	1.71	1.83	1.55
Total Technical Score				6.75	6.21	5.45	4.82	4.55	4.55
Cost Proposal									
2014 Partial-Yr. (Oct-Dec) Retainer Fee:				\$25,000	\$49,000	\$55,000	\$52,500	\$35,000	\$15,000
2015 Full-Year Annual Retainer Fee:				\$225,000	\$196,000	\$350,000	\$210,000	\$220,000	\$270,000
Actuarial Audit Support Fee:				\$0	\$12,500	\$16,000	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$10,000
Total 15 Month Cost				\$250,000	\$257,500	\$421,000	\$277,500	\$270,000	\$295,000
Total Cost Score		20%	2.0	2.00	1.90	1.20	1.80	1.90	1.70
Total Score		100%	10.0	8.75	8.11	6.65	6.62	6.45	6.25
Rank				1*	2	3	4	5	6

* After vendor presentations and ETF Board deliberations, ETF Staff was directed to issue a Letter of intent to contract with Gabriel Roeder Smith & Company.

**Weighted Score Sheet
RFP ETD0012**

Consulting Actuary to the State of Wisconsin Employee Trust Funds Board for the Health Insurance Programs Offered by the State of Wisconsin Group Insurance Board

	Raw Score	Weight	Weighted Score	Segal Consulting	Deloitte Consulting LLP	PricewaterhouseCoopers	Aon Hewitt	GRS Gabriel Roeder Smith
2. Mandatory Proposer Qualifications and Terms								
2.1 Experience and References	10	10.0%	1.0	0.73	0.73	0.60	0.47	0.50
2.2 Standards for Supervising Actuaries	10	10.0%	1.0	0.63	0.73	0.60	0.63	0.53
2.3 Security and Privacy	10	5.0%	0.5	0.30	0.32	0.32	0.30	0.28
2.4 Quality Control	10	5.0%	0.5	0.35	0.33	0.33	0.28	0.30
Total	40	30.0%	3.0	2.02	2.12	1.85	1.68	1.62
3. Actuarial Consulting Services								
3.1 General Actuarial and Consulting Services	10	20.0%	2.0	1.53	1.47	1.40	1.07	1.00
3.2 Other Technical Services	10	2.0%	0.2	0.13	0.11	0.13	0.11	0.13
3.3 Annual Review of Self-insured Health and Pharmacy Benefits Plans	10	3.0%	0.3	0.21	0.22	0.19	0.17	0.19
3.4 Annual Review of HMO Activity	10	15.0%	1.5	1.10	1.15	0.90	0.90	0.85
3.5 Review of Medicare Part D Activity	10	4.0%	0.4	0.27	0.28	0.25	0.27	0.25
3.6 Annual Health Insurance Important Dates and Deliverable Timetable	10	2.0%	0.2	0.14	0.14	0.13	0.13	0.14
5.5 Confidentiality of Participant Records	10	4.0%	0.4	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Total	70	50.0%	5.0	3.38	3.36	3.01	2.65	2.57
Total Technical Scores	110	80.0%	8.0	5.40	5.48	4.86	4.33	4.18
Cost Proposal								
2014 Partial-Yr. (Oct-Dec) Retainer Fee:				\$56,000	\$146,250	\$110,520	\$50,000	\$57,500
2015 Full-Year Annual Retainer Fee:				\$324,000	\$585,000	\$442,083	\$395,000	\$480,000
Total 15 Month Cost				\$380,000	\$731,250	\$552,603	\$445,000	\$537,500
Total Cost Score		20%	2.0	2.00	1.00	1.40	1.70	1.40
Total Score				7.40	6.48	6.26	6.03	5.58
Rank				1*	2	3	4	5

* After vendor presentations and ETF Board deliberations, ETF Staff was directed to issue a Letter of intent to contract with Segal Consulting.

Weighted Score Sheet

RFP ETD0013

Consulting Actuary to the State of Wisconsin Employee Trust Funds Board for the Group Insurance and Disability Programs Offered by the State of Wisconsin Group Insurance Board and the Wisconsin Retirement Board

	Raw Score	Weight	Weighted Score	PricewaterhouseCoopers	Milliman	Deloitte Consulting LLP
2. Mandatory Proposer Qualifications and Terms						
2.1 Experience and References	10	14.0%	1.4	0.79	0.84	0.89
2.2 Standards for Supervising Actuaries	10	14.0%	1.4	0.70	0.84	1.03
2.3 Security and Privacy	10	5.0%	0.5	0.40	0.30	0.40
2.4 Quality Control	10	5.0%	0.5	0.33	0.42	0.37
Total	40	38.0%	3.8	2.23	2.40	2.68
3. Actuarial Consulting Services						
3.1 Income Continuation Insurance Program Review	10	8.0%	0.8	0.51	0.51	0.56
3.2 Annual Review of Section 40.65 Duty Disability Program	10	8.0%	0.8	0.48	0.59	0.64
3.3 Review of Long Term Disability Insurance Plan	10	8.0%	0.8	0.48	0.56	0.61
3.4 Review of Optional Employee-pay-all Insurance Programs	10	5.0%	0.5	0.28	0.28	0.37
3.5 Review of Group Life Insurance Plans	10	8.0%	0.8	0.45	0.45	0.48
3.6 Other Technical Services	10	5.0%	0.5	0.28	0.30	0.30
Total	60	42.0%	4.2	2.49	2.69	2.96
Total Technical Scores	100	80.0%	8.0	4.71	5.09	5.64
Cost Proposal						
2014 Partial-Yr. (Oct-Dec) Retainer Fee:				\$18,434	\$15,000	\$44,429
2015 Full-Year Annual Retainer Fee:				\$73,737	\$115,000	\$177,717
Total 15 Month Cost				\$92,171	\$130,000	\$222,146
Total Cost Score		20.0%	2.0	2.00	1.40	0.80
Total Score				6.71	6.49	6.44
Rank				1	2*	3

* After vendor presentations and ETF Board deliberations, ETF Staff was directed to issue a Letter of intent to contract with Milliman, Inc.